

NHD VIRTUAL CONTEST JUDGING PROCESSES

As a judge, you are the face of History Day for our participants. It is important that the judging be fair and consistent. **History Day is likely the most difficult project a student has completed.** Many of the students have invested hundreds of hours in their project. Interact in a way that allows each student to feel proud of the work they have done.

<p>1. REMEMBER →</p> <p>The goal of History Day is to provide every student with a positive judging experience, regardless of whether they win.</p> <p>We want ALL LEARNERS to have a positive and constructive evaluation of their scholarship from the judges and receive meaningful written feedback on their work.</p>	<p>2. READ THE PAPERWORK →</p> <p>Take 5 minutes to read the Process Paper and Annotated Bibliography. Evaluate the student’s research.</p> <p>Look for quality of the research: credible sources, wide range of sources, depth of research, difficulty, going the extra mile. Be aware that quantity does not always indicate quality.</p>
<p>3. VIEW/READ THE PROJECT →</p> <p>Judges should thoroughly read/view each project before the interview.</p> <p>Come prepared with questions to ask the students.</p> <p>You may write up your comments for the students in advance, but you should mark the evaluation grids together as a team.</p>	<p>4. INTERVIEW →</p> <p>There will not be remote/virtual interviews with students.</p>
<p>5. RANKINGS & RADIO BUTTONS →</p> <p>Collaborate with your co-judges to make your decisions on which projects should advance.</p> <p>Judge teams must agree on the entries they select to move forward. History Day staff will let you know the specific number of projects you are selecting.</p> <p>Rank all of the entries in your pool. The team captain submits the rankings.</p> <p>Radio buttons on the evaluation rubrics should be consistent with your co-judges.</p>	<p>6. WRITE YOUR COMMENTS</p> <p>Each judge will write their own comments. Use language that is kind and respectful.</p> <p>Your feedback should be specific and helpful, and include a minimum of 2 strengths and 2 suggestions for improvement. Always wrap up with a positive.</p> <p>The online judging system requires a minimum of 300 characters in each comment box.</p>

Final Checklist for Judging a History Day Entry:

- Does this student’s work demonstrate historical research and scholarship?
- Does the student make a strong argument, connected to the annual theme?
- Does the student use evidence (historical sources) to support and prove their argument?
- Is this student communicating their ideas in an organized and effective way?
- Judges should respect topic choice.
- Student views may differ from your own.

WRITING MEANINGFUL COMMENTS

YOUR COMMENTS MATTER!

The key to History Day judging is providing students with positive, meaningful evaluations of their work. In this virtual year, your written comments are the **ONLY** feedback students will receive from their contest experience. They won't have an opportunity to engage directly with you through an interview, or to interact with peers and the public at a physical contest.

EQUITY

You may judge students from different demographic or learning backgrounds than you are accustomed to. Don't assume that problems indicate a lack of effort. History Day is a wonderful tool for differentiated learning, and every student grows and builds from where they started. Your comments should show respect for the student's individual learning.

ALWAYS give students the benefit of the doubt.

COMMENT STARTERS

Positives

- You show good understanding of X.
- I like the way you handled Y.
- Strong analysis of Z.
- Perceptive use of the theme.
- Well-written.
- Excellent technology/creativity.
- Your passion/hard work really shows!

Criticisms

- I wanted to hear more about...
- Did you consider...
- You may want to...

Why Constructive Comments are Helpful for Students

- Students who are advancing need to know how they can improve their work for the next level of competition.
- Students who are NOT advancing want to understand why their project was not selected.

Things to Avoid

- Being nitpicky about bibliography formatting, grammar, etc.
- Criticizing without offering ideas for improvement.
- Lack of respect for student choice.
- Failing to acknowledge individual learning.
- Intolerance of political or cultural differences.



Comment Cookie Sandwich

- 2 strengths
- 2 suggestions
- + 1 positive takeaway
- 5 comments (or more!)

STUCK? Try writing about:

- Theme connection
- Thesis and analysis
- Research: variety of sources, use of primary sources, suggest scholarly sources, etc.
- Historical context: what set the stage for this topic?
- Historical significance: what were the impacts/outcomes?
- Clarity: organization, logic, use of multimedia, stage presence, etc.